New York City Planning Commission Public Hearing, July 10th, 2024 City of Yes for Housing Opportunity

Testimony Examination and Analysis

Prepared for:

Queens Civic Congress

CPC Public Hearing on the "City of Yes for Housing Opportunity" - July 10th, 2024

Testimony Examination and Analysis

Background

On July 10th, 2024, the New York City Planning Commission held a single public hearing on the most dramatic proposal to change land use in the City of New York since the adoption of the 1961 Zoning Resolution: The *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*. This package of dozens of proposals – initially 1386 pages long and amended to 1383 pages when approved by the CPC on September 25th, 2024, in a 10-3 vote – will, if adopted by the City Council, deregulate land use across the City of New York. Areas zoned for lower-density today – R1 through R5 zones – will see dramatic and unsustainable increases in potential density through specific changes to the zoning code, categorized in the package of proposals as "District Fixes"; "Accessory Dwelling Units"; "Transit-Oriented Development"; "Town Center" Zoning; and "Campus Infill" among others.

The progenesis of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* – with repeated taglines such as "Just a little more housing in every neighborhood," "gentle density," "right-sizing" and more – was the creation at the very beginning of the Adams administration of the Building and Land Use Approval Streamlining Taskforce aka the BLAST Committee. The BLAST Committee was made up of significant campaign donors and friends of Mayor Adams, specifically some of the biggest developers, real estate lobby organizations, land-use attorneys, construction companies, consultant "shops" and pro-housing advocates.

Six months later, a document was released called the *Get Stuff Built: BLAST Report* which made 111 recommendations on how to "streamline" and otherwise deregulate the zoning code. Some of the recommendations were brought forward as separate actions, such as "Green Fast Track" which has removed environmental review from all "small" projects, those with 175 units or less (which are clearly not small); and land use legislation to pursue the development of a casino in numerous locations around the city. The rest of the recommendations became the *City of Yes for Carbon Neutrality; Economic Opportunity*; and *Housing Opportunity*. *Carbon Neutrality* was approved in late 2023; *Economic Opportunity* was approved with significant amendments made by the City Council in June of 2024. *Housing Opportunity* will have its singular hearing on October 21-22 at the City Council Zoning Subcommittee and the full Council must vote on it by December of 2024.

<u>Note</u>: On September 25th, 8 hours after the CPC voted in favor of City of Yes for Housing Opportunity, multiple indictments against Mayor Eric Adams, including those pertaining to expediting permits and inspections of buildings in exchange for personal favors and straw donations for his 2021 campaign, were leaked to the press.

The CPC Hearing – July 10th, 2024

The sole public hearing held by the City Planning Commission on the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* was ultimately one of the longest in the history of any New York City agency. The hearing lasted approximately 15 hours, and 198 speakers testified in person (not including elected officials); over 100 additional speakers were scheduled to give testimony but ultimately left the hearing in person or on Zoom prior to their name being called. 125 pieces of written testimony were also submitted and placed into the public record, although 21 were duplicative of oral testimony already given, resulting in 104 unique pieces of written testimony.

The 15-hour hearing was unusual for several reasons, not the least of which was the aggressive behavior of the Chair, Dan Garodnick, who went out of his way to praise those who supported the proposal while attacking, insulting, demeaning, lecturing or otherwise dismissing the concerns of those in opposition. In addition, the amount of additional time granted to those in favor – up to over 10 additional minutes in several cases – in terms of testimony and follow-up questions from Commissioners, was an obvious "thumb on the scale" to those in attendance or watching the hearing remotely.

On September 25th, 2024, during a 9-minute speech extolling the greatness of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* and before casting his vote in favor, Chair Garodnick made this statement:

From the public review process so far, it's clear that many New Yorkers agree on the need for us to address the housing crisis. The City of Yes received positive recommendations from Brooklyn Borough President Antonio Reynoso, Bronx Borough President Vanessa Gibson, Manhattan Borough President Mark Levine, Queens Borough President Donovan Richards – and 18 of the City's Community Boards. During our marathon public hearing in July, we heard from more than 200 people over the course of the day, a majority of whom testified in favor of the proposal...we held over 175 Community Board meetings throughout the City in the spring and summer to explain the proposal, answer questions and garner feedback.

While the statement that Chair Garodnick made is technically true, it is <u>everything that he</u> <u>left out</u> that is the focus of this examination and analysis.

Community Board and Borough President Votes

As stated by Chair Garodnick, only 18 Community Boards across the City voted in favor of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*: 4 CBs in the Bronx, 6 CBs in Brooklyn, 6 CBs in Manhattan and 2 CBs in Queens. What Garodnick did not say was that, with the exception of Manhattan (4 CBs), all other Boroughs had a majority of Community Boards in Opposition: 7 out of 12 in the Bronx, 10 out of 18 in Brooklyn, 12 out of 14 in Queens and 3 out of 3 in Staten Island. In addition, in Manhattan, one board chose to abstain, and another voted on each proposal; in Brooklyn, two boards did not vote; and in the Bronx, one board did not vote. In total, 36 Community Boards voted No, double the 18 that voted Yes. And, of the 36 that voted No, 28 voted NO (No without Conditions). Only 8 Community Boards – 4 in Manhattan, 2 in Brooklyn and 1 each in the Bronx and Queens – voted No with Conditions. On the flip side, all but two of the Yes votes – one in Manhattan and one in Brooklyn – were with Conditions.

Most Community Boards who voted No did so due to the minimal effort and expedited timeline – as well as the actual proposed changes to the zoning code, which are extinction-level events for many communities across the city should they be adopted – that the Department of City Planning has pursued during this exercise. The *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* is the largest proposed change to zoning in New York City since the adoption of the 1961 Zoning Resolution. The proposal took less than two years to write, introduce and go through the ULURP process; by contrast, it took almost 25 years for the 1961 Zoning Resolution to be adopted. Garodnick's faux self-impressed statement that "over 175 Community Board meetings were held throughout the City" rings hollow; this comes out to a paltry average of three meetings per Community Board before they had to vote on the most complicated and purposefully convoluted set of zoning changes in the City's history.

Despite overwhelming opposition from Community Boards, four out of five Borough Presidents voted Yes, including in Brooklyn and the Bronx, where 33% of Community Boards voted Yes, and in Queens where it was a minimal 14% in the affirmative. Donovan Richards, the Borough President of Queens who voted Yes with Conditions even with 12 out of 14 Community Boards voting No, stated in a September 7th Reuters interview:

"I think it's fear – fear of change," said Richards...Richards called City of Yes a modest proposal that would not significantly alter low-density neighborhoods, but acknowledged the need for more affordable housing and parking in areas with little public transit.

A week before the indictments, when there were already concerns about investigations into Mayor Adams and his inner circle, Richards was interviewed by *Gothamist* on September 18th after a major rally in opposition to City of Yes took place in Bayside:

Queens Borough President Donovan Richards, who is backing the City of Yes proposal, said Adams' vulnerabilities don't detract from the proposal's merits.

"The bottom line is we are in a housing state of emergency and even with the distractions, the Council will take a vote on this plan," Richards said. "This is a necessary proposal."

Richards, the Queens borough president, said many opponents are exaggerating how much people care about the City of Yes plan. He cited a recent slate of events he participated in during his "Borough Hall on Your Block" series in Rockaway.

"I've done 30 events in the Rockaways this week," said Richards. "The subject of City of Yes has come up twice."

Contrary to Richards's inaccurate assessment, *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* has been a top story in every local news and media outlet that focuses on Queens for months. However, in an unintentional way, he is correct about one thing: despite months of regular publicity, there are still large segments of the population throughout the city that have no idea what the City of Yes is and how it will fundamentally change their lives if it becomes law.

Public Testimony at the CPC Hearing

As stated previously, 198 speakers testified at the City Planning Commission hearing, not including elected officials; 112 spoke in favor, 86 in opposition. An additional 125 pieces of written testimony were submitted as well. For the purposes of this report, there were 104 unique pieces of written testimony, as 21 were duplicates of speakers who had already testified in person at the public hearing. Out of 104 pieces of written testimony, 3 spoke in favor and 101 were opposed. Based on simple math, out of 302 testimonials in total, 115 (38.1%) were in favor, 187 (61.9%) were opposed.

Chair Garodnick did not reveal this information before the September 25th vote, as it would be detrimental to his patently false narrative of broad support for the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*. However, these numbers don't even begin to tell the whole story of how this process has been manipulated by Mayor Adams, Chair Garodnick and the entire administration.

Of the 112 speakers who spoke in favor of the City of Yes for Housing Opportunity, the vast majority were representatives of organizations with skin in the game, so to speak. Most of the organizations in question are developers (both for-profit and non-for-profit), real estate consortiums, large landlord groups, pro-housing alliances, big business associations and transportation / parking advocates.

82 speakers, or 73% of all who testified in favor in person, represented 62 separate organizations who stand to benefit financially or otherwise from passage of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*. Some examples of those who testified are the *Real Estate Board*

of New York (REBNY), New York City's leading real estate trade association with over 15,000 members; Citizens Housing and Planning Council, a Who's Who of developers, architects and lobbyists disguised as a non-profit housing organization; Open New York, a developer and tech-funded advocacy group that aggressively calls for sweeping deregulation of zoning and land use laws in New York and across the United States; StreetsPAC, a political action committee whose purpose is to fund and elect politicians who call for the elimination of both onsite parking mandates and on-street parking as well as increased development; Kramer Levin and Fried, Frank, one-stop legal shops for the largest developers in New York City to get zoning changes and variances; and the New York Housing Conference, an advocacy clearinghouse for developers, both for-profit and non-profit, who lobby for the creation of "decent and affordable" housing in New York City.

In addition, many organizations sent multiple spokespersons to the hearing. For example, Open New York had no less than 14 speakers or 12.5 % of all speakers in favor (four of which did not reveal their affiliation – see below); Open Plans had four speakers (one of which did not reveal her affiliation); the American Institute of Architects New York Chapter (AIANY) had three speakers; the New York State Council of Churches / Interfaith Affordable Housing Collaborative had three speakers; REBNY had two speakers; Citizens Housing and Planning Council had two speakers; and Frank Fried and Kramer Levin each had two speakers. In addition, due to cross-affiliations, the New York Housing Conference had three speakers who were directly affiliated with their organization but were also working for another organization. In all, those nine organizations fielded 35 speakers.

Of the remaining 40 speakers in favor, approximately 30 speakers stated that they were simply testifying as residents of New York City. However, many of those speakers purposefully did not reveal their affiliations, employment or lobbying status (see below). The remainder were varied – and on occasion noteworthy for being rather unusual.

By contrast, of the 86 speakers who testified in opposition, 37 testified as representatives of voluntary non-profit civic and homeowner associations who each look after the interests of thousands of residents in a geographical area; and 7 testified for advocacy organizations mostly pertaining to historic preservation. Of the remaining 42 speakers, 30 were simply concerned residents, tenants and homeowners in opposition; the rest of the speakers were either Community Board members officially representing the position of their boards or unpaid activists – including several who are running for elected office – in opposition. It stands to reason that if civic and homeowner associations turned out dozens of people to testify in opposition, Chair Garodnick's metrics for counting would have been different.

As for the written testimony, of the three testimonials in favor, two represent an organization and the other a resident; of the 101 in opposition, 83 (82.2%) were simply concerned residents, while 12 represented civic and homeowner associations.

Based upon the above data, it is clear that a large majority of speakers were opposed.

Purposeful Non-Disclosure of Affiliations and Registered Lobbyist Status During Testimony

As will be made abundantly clear later in this report, while there were many organizations who fielded spokespersons and clearly identified who they were, not one speaker identified whether they were being paid to speak; if their organization was lobbying New York City Government; if they were a registered lobbyist; or a member of the BLAST committee.

Even more concerning was a number of speakers who <u>purposefully</u> hid their affiliation with the organizations which they belonged to and, in some cases, that they were an employee and registered lobbyist for.

For example, Samir Lavingia had no problem identifying himself as the former Chair of Community Board 5 in Manhattan and implied that he's just another concerned citizen in favor of *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*, stating in part "I live in Midtown at 55th and Broadway. And I'm one of those statistics. I'm severely rent burdened. I pay over 50% of my income in rent." (*Read Lavingia's full testimony below*). What Lavingia failed to disclose was that he is an employee of Open New York and works full time as their Campaign Coordinator. Lavingia is also a registered lobbyist.

Three other members of Open New York, Vishnu Reddy, the Queens Chapter Leader (see *full testimony below*); Adam Brodheim, a resident of the Upper West Side; and Erik Nilsen, a resident of Brooklyn that have all openly identified themselves previously as full members of Open New York, failed to disclose their affiliation.

Emily Chingay also failed to identify her credentials and affiliations. In her testimony, she in part said "So I live in Astoria. I've lived in my current apartment for about 2 years now. And I love my neighborhood...I would really love to stay here and not risk being priced out and not being able to afford my apartment." (*Read Chingay*'s *full testimony below*) Chingay failed to disclose that she is a full-time employee of Open Plans as their Citywide Engagement Advocate.

Elena Sytcheva also failed to identify her credentials and affiliations. In her testimony, she in part said "I'm a lifelong Brooklyn resident of over 30 years. I grew up in Mitchell Lama housing in Sheepshead Bay Brooklyn and I currently rent in the Greenpoint neighborhood in Brooklyn CB 1. And it would be my preference to stay and raise a family here in this great borough." (Read Sytcheva's full testimony below). Sytcheva failed to disclose that she is a full-time employee of the Metropolitan Council on Jewish Poverty with the title of Co-Managing Director of Housing, Regulatory Compliance and Affordable Housing Development.

The purposeful disinformation and lack of disclosure by paid employees and lobbyists of organizations that will benefit from the passage of *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* and/or already have a financial interest in New York City Government demands immediate

further investigation, particularly in connection with the current and continuing indictments in the Adams administration.

In addition, many others who testified did not disclose their backgrounds or affiliations. After careful analysis and research there are plenty of reasons why they chose to try to conceal their affiliations and/or identities. Several stand out:

Sara Bronin, Chair of the President's Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (of whom Adam Brodheim of Open New York is employed as Special Assistant to the Chair) who testified in favor in that capacity, is an architect and attorney who was previously the Chair of the Planning and Zoning Commission of Hartford Connecticut until this year (and married to the former Mayor of Connecticut who left office on January 1st, 2024) and conducted similar 'City of Yes' types of zoning deregulation there and across Connecticut. Not only did she testify in favor, but she was also a signatory on Mayor Adams's September 25th, 2024, Press Release after the City Planning Commission vote (see below).

Michelle Kuppersmith and Dorothy Windham are both members of Open New York who testified in favor. They are also the Executive Director and Digital Research Associate of the Campaign for Accountability, a self-described "watchdog organization that uses research, litigation and aggressive communications to expose misconduct and malfeasance in public life." Given their affiliation with Open New York, an opaque organization that routinely has members who are not honest in public life (see Samir Lanvingia, Vishnu Reddy. Adam Brodheim and Erik Nilsen in this report) and are extremely secretive about their funding sources, this can only be described as self-serving and hypocritical.

Roberta "Bobbi" Barnett testified in favor and identified herself as a Manhattan resident and Community Board 4 member who has worked on housing policy issues "for the better part of the last decade." However, Barnett did not disclose that she is the New York Democratic Senate Counsel and Program Office's Senior Policy Advisor.

Timothy Burke testified in favor representing a new political group, NYC New Liberals. What he did not reveal was that he currently works for New York City Housing Preservation and Development Agency (HPD) which has a direct interest in seeing CoYHO passed.

Cormac McKay testified in favor and described himself as a visitor with an interest in moving to New York in the near future. What he did not reveal is that he is an Irish government lobbyist specifically advocating for more housing development.

Charles Ny testified in favor stating that he is a blind/disabled resident and Manhattan Community Board 5 member. Charles Ny AKA Charles Ghose is a convicted sex-offender.

Analysis of Testimony in Favor of City of Yes for Housing Opportunity

The compromised nature of a majority of the speakers in favor of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* who spoke at the July 10th, 2024, City Planning Commission public hearing cannot be overstated and, contrary to Chair Garodnick's ruse of using simple math to declare public support for the application, defines the false equivalency between those clearly-defined special interest groups in favor – as well as many conflicts of interest and incestuous cross-affiliations between organizations – and the almost entirely unpaid, non-lobbying and financially uninvolved civic- and resident-based opposition. Those who testified representing developers, contractors, lobbyists, trade groups, land use attorneys, housing organizations and other interested parties that will benefit financially from the adoption of the City of Yes for Housing Opportunity cannot be in any way compared to voluntary civic and homeowner associations representing (in this case) hundreds of thousands of homeowners, tenants and – most importantly – registered voters.

Summary and Conclusion

The City Planning Commission's hearing for the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* (*CoYHO*) on July 10th, 2024, revealed long-term coordination, collaboration and collusion between the Adams administration and interested parties who stand to gain financially from and at the expense of the residents of New York City. Chair Garodnick's – and the Borough Presidents of the Bronx, Brooklyn and Queens - blithe minimalization or complete disregard of majority Community Board and overall public disapproval for *CoYHO* reveals the alignment of and blind eye to massive corruption in the Adams administration surrounding the real estate, housing and construction industry.

Far from being a proposal to increase the amount of affordable housing in New York City, this deregulatory scheme will allow unbridled development throughout the city, with a laser-like focus on removing owner-occupied housing and replacing it with market-rate and luxury rental units. Given that the current zoning in place today can more than accommodate significant additional development for between 8 and 12 million more people, the impetus for and fast-tracked nature of *CoYHO* can only be chalked up to the ties – legitimate or not – between Mayor Adams's donors, friends and allies in elected office and the real estate, housing and construction industry.

Detailed examination and analysis of the 1569-page transcript of the hearing also confirms the preferential treatment given to the supporters of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* and shockingly poor handling of those in opposition by Chair Garodnick in his quest to push these zoning changes through no matter what, as per the Adams administration's wishes.

Some key takeaways:

- 55 (49.1%) speakers representing 49 organizations in favor were <u>paid</u> representatives of organizations that stand to benefit from *CoYHO*.
- 56 (50%) speakers representing 30 organizations directly and 4 organizations indirectly that are clients/beneficiaries of lobbyists or who lobby New York City government directly gave testimony in favor of *CoYHO*.
- 24 (21.4%) speakers representing 20 organizations in favor are <u>registered lobbyists</u> for organizations that stand to benefit from the *CoYHO*.
- 36 (32.1%) speakers representing 31 organizations in favor will <u>directly benefit</u> <u>financially from CoYHO</u>.
- 18 (16.1%) speakers representing 15 organizations who were members of the <u>BLAST</u> <u>Committee</u> and co-authored the <u>Get Stuff Built</u> list that became the City of Yes gave testimony in favor of the *CoYHO*.
- 64 (57.1%) speakers representing 41 organizations in favor are part of the <u>New York Housing Conference "Yes to Housing" coalition.</u>
- 22 (35.5%) out of 62 organizations that testified in favor on July 10th, 2024, public hearing were signatories to <u>Mayor Adams press release</u> from September 25th, 2024.

Paid Representatives

55 (49.1%) speakers representing 49 organizations in favor were paid representatives of organizations that stand to benefit from the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity (CoYHO)*. In other words, they are "on the clock" – getting paid compensation or a salary to testify. By contrast, 6 (7%) of speakers in opposition, including the author of this report, were paid representatives in opposition.

List of Paid Representatives for Organizations in Favor of CoYHO:

Organization	Representative	Title
Abundance NY	Ryder Kessler	Executive Director
American Institute of Architects NY	Bria Donohue	Senior Manager, Gov't Affairs
Association for a Better New York	Chad Purkey	Interim Executive Director
Ass'n for Neighborhood & Housing Development	Barika Williams	Executive Director
Bowery Residents Committee (BRC)	Kyle Jeremiah	Director of External Affairs
Bronx Pro Group LLC	Robert Poole	Spokesperson
Camba Housing Ventures	Francesca Brown	Afford./Support. Housing Spec.
Catholic Community Relations Council	Joseph Rosenberg	Executive Director
Center for New York City Neighborhoods	Christine Peale	Executive Director
Citizens Budget Commission	Sean Campion	Director Housing/Economic Dev.
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Howard Slatkin	Executive Director
Community Housing Improvement Program	Adam Roberts	Director
Community Preservation Corporation	Emily Klein	Senior Policy Associate
Downtown Brooklyn Partnership	Regina Myer	President
Enterprise Community Partners	Patrick Boyle	Senior Director for NY Office
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Anita Laremont	Partner
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Carol Rosenthal	Counsel
Gotham Organization	Bryan Kelly	President, Development
Habitat for Humanity	Sabrina Lippman	CEO
Health and Housing Consortium	Bonnie Mohan	Executive Director
Homeless Services United (HSU)	Eric Lee	Director of Policy
Housing Rights Initiative	Kate Liggett	Program Coordinator
Hudson Companies	Markee Busching	Managing Dir.of Development
Interfaith Assembly/Interfaith Affordable Housing	Marc Greenberg	Executive Director
Kramer Levin	James Power	Partner
Kramer Levin	Paul Selver	Co-Chair, Land Use Department
Lantern Organization/Community Services	Daniel Kent	President & CEO
Low Income Investment Fund	Molly Anderson	Deputy Director
Mega Contracting and Development	Emanuel Kokinakis	Partner
Met Council on Jewish Poverty	Elena Sytcheva*	Co-Managing Dir. Housing
Municipal Arts Society	Thomas Devaney	Director, Land Use and Planning
New New York	Benjamin (BJ) Jones	Executive Director
New York Building Congress	Carlo Casa	Director of Policy & Research
New York Housing Conference	Rachel Fee	Executive Director
New York League of Conservation Voters	Alia Soomro	Deputy Director of Policy
NHP / New York Housing Conference	Micah Hunter	Project Manager
Niskanen Center	Alex Armlovich	Senior Housing Policy Analyst
NYS Council of Churches/Interfaith Aff. Housing	Peter Cook	Executive Director/President

NYS Council of Churches/Interfaith Aff. Housing Rashida Tyler Deputy Executive Director

Open New York

Open New York

Samir Lavingia*

Open Plans

Jackson Chabot

Director of Advocacy

Michael Cuthorland

Paline Application

Open Plans Michael Sutherland Policy Analyst

Open PlansTalya SchwartzLead Strategist, Urban MobilityOpen PlansEmily Chingay*Citywide Engagement Advocate

Project Renewal Eric Rosenbaum President & CEO
REBNY Basha Gerhards Senior VP of Planning
Regional Plan Association Maulin Mehta New York Director
Riseboro Community Partnership/NYHC Emily Kurtz Chief Housing Officer

Robin Hood Foundation Chloe Sarnoff Director Policy, Res. & Initiatives

SEIU / Local 32BJ Manny Pasreich President

StreetsPACEric McClureExecutive DirectorSupportive Housing Network of New YorkPascale LeoneExecutive DirectorTech: NYCMarjorie VelasquezVice-President of Policy

West Side Federation for Senior/Support. Housing Eustacia Smith Representative

^{*}Emily Chingay, Samir Lavingia and Elena Sytcheva purposefully did not identify their affiliation with these organizations who pay their salary.

Organizations That Lobby

56 (50%) speakers representing 30 organizations directly and 4 organizations indirectly that are clients/beneficiaries of lobbyists or who lobby New York City government directly gave testimony in favor of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*. By contrast, 2 (1.8%) of the speakers in opposition were representing 2 organizations that are clients/beneficiaries of lobbyists or who lobby New York City government directly. None of these organizations revealed that they routinely lobby the New York City government to receive benefits, financial or otherwise.

List of Organizations Who Are Clients of Lobbyists / NYC Lobbyists in Favor of CoYHO:

Organization	Representative	Title
American Institute of Architects NY	Bria Donohue	Senior Manager, Gov't Affairs
American Institute of Architects NY	Darrick Borowski	Member, Housing Committee
American Institute of Architects NY	Jim Wright	Director of Advocacy
Amie Gross Architects**	Amie Gross	President
Ass'n for Neighborhood & Housing Development	Barika Williams	Executive Director
Camba Housing Ventures	Francesca Brown	Afford./Support. Housing Spec.
Catholic Community Relations Council	Joseph Rosenberg	Executive Director
Center for New York City Neighborhoods	Christine Peale	Executive Director
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Howard Slatkin	Executive Director
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Mark Ginsberg	President
Community Housing Improvement Program	Adam Roberts	Director
Community Preservation Corporation	Emily Klein	Senior Policy Associate
Dattner Architects**	John Woelfling	Principal
Enterprise Community Partners	Patrick Boyle	Senior Director for NY Office
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Anita Laremont	Partner
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Carol Rosenthal	Counsel
Gotham Organization**	Bryan Kelly	President, Development
Habitat for Humanity	Sabrina Lippman	CEO
Homeless Services United (HSU)	Eric Lee	Director of Policy
Hudson Companies	Markee Busching	Managing Dir.of Development
Kramer Levin	James Power	Partner
Kramer Levin	Paul Selver	Co-Chair, Land Use Department
Mega Contracting and Development	Emanuel Kokinakis	Partner
Met Council on Jewish Poverty	Elena Sytcheva*	Co-Managing Dir. Housing
Municipal Arts Society	Thomas Devaney	Director, Land Use and Planning
New York Building Congress	Carlo Casa	Director of Policy & Research
New York Housing Conference	Rachel Fee	Executive Director
NHP / New York Housing Conference**	Micah Hunter	Project Manager
Open New York	Logan Phares	Political Director
Open New York	Samir Lavingia*	Campaign Coordinator
Open New York	Elizabeth Denys	Board Member
Open New York	Michelle Kuppersmith	Board Member
Open New York	Sachi Takahashi-Rial	Board Member
Open New York	Vishnu Reddy*	Queens Chapter Leader
Open New York	Adam Brodheim*	Member
Open New York	Alexander McCoy	Member

Austin Celestin Member Open New York **Dorothy Windham** Member Open New York Matthew Denys Member Open New York Open New York Michael Kaess Member Olivia Killingsworth Member Open New York Open New York Erik Nilsen* Member

Open Plans Jackson Chabot Director of Advocacy

Open Plans Michael Sutherland Policy Analyst

Open Plans Talya Schwartz Lead Strategist, Urban Mobility
Open Plans Emily Chingay* Citywide Engagement Advocate

Project Renewal Eric Rosenbaum President & CEO
REBNY Basha Gerhards Senior VP of Planning

REBNY / Principal, Hill West Architects David West Zoning and Design Committee

Regional Plan Association Maulin Mehta New York Director
Riseboro Community Partnership/NYHC Emily Kurtz Chief Housing Officer

Robin Hood Foundation Chloe Sarnoff Director Policy, Res. & Initiatives

SEIU / Local 32BJ Manny Pasreich President

Supportive Housing Network of New York Pascale Leone Executive Director
Tech: NYC Marjorie Velasquez Vice-President of Policy

Transportation Alternatives Pedro Rodriguez Member

^{*}Adam Brodheim, Emily Chingay, Samir Lavingia, Erik Nilsen, Vishnu Reddy and Elena Sytcheva purposefully did not identify their affiliation with these organizations which lobby New York City government on a regular basis.

^{**} Amie Gross Architects, Dattner Architects and the Gotham Organization do not directly lobby New York City Government; however, their companies are materially involved in the Citizens Housing and Planning Council and the New York Housing Conference. Both organizations directly lobby the New York City Government.

Registered Lobbyists

24 (21.4%) speakers representing 20 organizations in favor are registered lobbyists for organizations that stand to benefit from the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*. By contrast, 1 (<1%) of speakers in opposition were registered lobbyists for organizations in opposition. None of these speakers revealed that they were registered lobbyists.

List of Registered Lobbyists for Organizations in Favor of CoYHO:

Organization	Representative	Title
American Institute of Architects NY	Bria Donohue	Senior Manager, Gov't Affairs
Ass'n for Neighborhood & Housing Development	Barika Williams	Executive Director
Catholic Community Relations Council	Joseph Rosenberg	Executive Director
Center for New York City Neighborhoods	Christine Peale	Executive Director
Community Housing Improvement Program	Adam Roberts	Director
Community Preservation Corporation	Emily Klein	Senior Policy Associate
Enterprise Community Partners	Patrick Boyle	Senior Director for NY Office
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Anita Laremont	Partner
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Carol Rosenthal	Counsel
Homeless Services United (HSU)	Eric Lee	Director of Policy
Kramer Levin	James Power	Partner
Kramer Levin	Paul Selver	Co-Chair, Land Use Department
Municipal Arts Society	Thomas Devaney	Director, Land Use and Planning
New York League of Conservation Voters	Alia Soomro	Deputy Director of Policy
Open New York	Logan Phares	Political Director
Open New York	Samir Lavingia*	Campaign Coordinator
Open Plans	Jackson Chabot	Director of Advocacy
Open Plans	Michael Sutherland	Policy Analyst
Regional Plan Association	Maulin Mehta	New York Director
Riseboro Community Partnership/NYHC	Emily Kurtz	Chief Housing Officer
Robin Hood Foundation	Chloe Sarnoff	Director Policy, Res. & Initiatives
SEIU / Local 32BJ	Manny Pasreich	President
Supportive Housing Network of New York	Pascale Leone	Executive Director
Tech: NYC	Marjorie Velasquez	Vice-President of Policy

^{*}Samir Lavingia purposefully did not identify his affiliation with Open New York which lobbies New York City government on a regular basis, nor did he identify that he is a registered lobbyist.

Financial Interest

36 (32.1%) speakers representing 31 organizations in favor will directly benefit financially from the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity (CoYHO)* including developers, architects, lawyers, social service agencies and others. In addition, other groups in support of CoYHO are already benefitting financially through existing New York City government contracts.

List of Organizations with a Financial Interest in Favor of CoYHO:

Organization	Representative	Title
American Institute of Architects NY	Bria Donohue	Senior Manager, Gov't Affairs
American Institute of Architects NY	Darrick Borowski	Member, Housing Committee
American Institute of Architects NY	Jim Wright	Director of Advocacy
Amie Gross Architects	Amie Gross	President
Ass'n for Neighborhood & Housing Development	Barika Williams	Executive Director
Bowery Residents Committee (BRC)	Kyle Jeremiah	Director of External Affairs
Bronx Pro Group LLC	Robert Poole	Spokesperson
Camba Housing Ventures	Francesca Brown	Afford./Support. Housing Spec.
Catholic Community Relations Council	Joseph Rosenberg	Executive Director
Center for New York City Neighborhoods	Christine Peale	Executive Director
Community Preservation Corporation	Emily Klein	Senior Policy Associate
Dattner Architects	John Woelfling	Principal
Downtown Brooklyn Partnership	Regina Myer	President
Enterprise Community Partners	Patrick Boyle	Senior Director for NY Office
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Anita Laremont	Partner
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Carol Rosenthal	Counsel
Gotham Organization	Bryan Kelly	President, Development
Habitat for Humanity	Sabrina Lippman	CEO
Homeless Services United (HSU)	Eric Lee	Director of Policy
Hudson Companies	Markee Busching	Managing Dir.of Development
Kramer Levin	James Power	Partner
Kramer Levin	Paul Selver	Co-Chair, Land Use Department
Lantern Organization/Community Services	Daniel Kent	President & CEO
Low Income Investment Fund	Molly Anderson	Deputy Director
Mega Contracting and Development	Emanuel Kokinakis	Partner
Met Council on Jewish Poverty	Elena Sytcheva*	Co-Managing Dir. Housing
New York Building Congress	Carlo Casa	Director of Policy & Research
New York Housing Conference	Rachel Fee	Executive Director
Project Renewal	Eric Rosenbaum	President & CEO
REBNY	Basha Gerhards	Senior VP of Planning
REBNY / Principal, Hill West Architects	David West	Zoning and Design Committee
Regional Plan Association	Maulin Mehta	New York Director
Riseboro Community Partnership/NYHC	Emily Kurtz	Chief Housing Officer
Supportive Housing Network of New York	Pascale Leone	Executive Director
The Delaine Companies	Jerrod Delaine	CEO
West Side Federation for Senior/Support. Housin	g Eustacia Smith	Representative

^{*}Elena Sytcheva purposefully did not identify her affiliation with this organization.

BLAST Committee

18 (16.1%) speakers representing 15 organizations who were members of the BLAST Committee and co-authored the Get Stuff Built list that became the City of Yes gave testimony in favor of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* on July 10th, 2024, without revealing their direct involvement with the creation of the proposal. This is fully 30% (15 out of 50) of all of the private non-governmental organizations that were members of the BLAST Committee.

List of Organizations that were part of the BLAST Committee:

Organization	Representative	Title
Ass'n for Neighborhood & Housing Development	Barika Williams	Executive Director
Catholic Community Relations Council	Joseph Rosenberg	Executive Director
Center for New York City Neighborhoods	Christine Peale	Executive Director
Citizens Budget Commission	Sean Campion	Director Housing/Economic
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Howard Slatkin	Executive Director
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Mark Ginsberg	President
Enterprise Community Partners	Patrick Boyle	Senior Director for NY Office
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Anita Laremont	Partner
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Carol Rosenthal	Counsel
Kramer Levin	James Power	Partner
Kramer Levin	Paul Selver	Co-Chair, Land Use Department
Mega Contracting and Development	Emanuel Kokinakis	Partner
Municipal Arts Society	Thomas Devaney	Director, Land Use and Planning
REBNY	Basha Gerhards	Senior VP of Planning
REBNY / Principal, Hill West Architects	David West	Zoning and Design Committee
Regional Plan Association	Maulin Mehta	New York Director
SEIU / Local 32BJ	Manny Pasreich	President
Supportive Housing Network of New York	Pascale Leone	Executive Director

<u>Note</u>: Many other speakers on July 10th, 2024, public hearing who testified in favor sit on a number of the Boards of or are materially involved in these organizations, particularly REBNY and Citizens Housing & Planning Council.

Member, New York Housing Conference (NYHC) "Yes to Housing" Coalition

64 (57.1%) speakers representing 41 organizations in favor are part of the New York Housing Conference "Yes to Housing" coalition, a coordinated campaign working in direct collusion with the Adams administration comprised of developers, real estate companies, social service agencies, pro-housing advocates and other allies, many of whom stand to benefit financially or otherwise from the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity* should it pass.

List of NYHC "Yes to Housing" Coalition who Testified in Favor of CoYHO:

Organization	Representative	Title
American Institute of Architects NY	Bria Donohue	Senior Manager, Gov't Affairs
American Institute of Architects NY	Darrick Borowski	Member, Housing Committee
American Institute of Architects NY	Jim Wright	Director of Advocacy
Amie Gross Architects	Amie Gross	President
Association for a Better New York	Chad Purkey	Interim Executive Director
Ass'n for Neighborhood & Housing Development	Barika Williams	Executive Director
Bowery Residents Committee (BRC)	Kyle Jeremiah	Director of External Affairs
Bronx Pro Group LLC	Robert Poole	Spokesperson
Camba Housing Ventures	Francesca Brown	Afford./Support. Housing Spec.
Catholic Community Relations Council	Joseph Rosenberg	Executive Director
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Howard Slatkin	Executive Director
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Mark Ginsberg	President
Community Housing Improvement Program	Adam Roberts	Director
Community Preservation Corporation	Emily Klein	Senior Policy Associate
Dattner Architects	John Woelfling	Principal
Designing the WE / Undesigned Red Line	Braden Crooks	Co-Founder/Creator
Enterprise Community Partners	Patrick Boyle	Senior Director for NY Office
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Anita Laremont	Partner
Fried, Frank Law Firm	Carol Rosenthal	Counsel
Gotham Organization	Bryan Kelly	President, Development
Habitat for Humanity	Sabrina Lippman	CEO
Health and Housing Consortium	Bonnie Mohan	Executive Director
Homeless Services United (HSU)	Eric Lee	Director of Policy
Housing Rights Initiative	Kate Liggett	Program Coordinator
Hudson Companies	Markee Busching	Managing Dir.of Development
Interfaith Assembly/Interfaith Affordable Housing	Marc Greenberg	Executive Director
Kramer Levin	James Power	Partner
Kramer Levin	Paul Selver	Co-Chair, Land Use Department
Lantern Organization/Community Services	Daniel Kent	President & CEO
Low Income Investment Fund	Molly Anderson	Deputy Director
Mega Contracting and Development	Emanuel Kokinakis	Partner
New York Building Congress	Carlo Casa	Director of Policy & Research
New York Housing Conference	Rachel Fee	Executive Director
New York League of Conservation Voters	Alia Soomro	Deputy Director of Policy
NHP / New York Housing Conference	Micah Hunter	Project Manager
NYS Council of Churches/Interfaith Aff. Housing	Peter Cook	Executive Director/President
NYS Council of Churches/Interfaith Aff. Housing	Rashida Tyler	Deputy Executive Director
NYC New Liberals	Timothy Bur	

Open New York Logan Phares Political Director Open New York Samir Lavingia* Campaign Coordinator Elizabeth Denys **Board Member** Open New York Michelle Kuppersmith **Board Member** Open New York Sachi Takahashi-Rial **Board Member** Open New York Open New York Vishnu Reddy* Queens Chapter Leader Adam Brodheim* Member Open New York Open New York Alexander McCoy Member Austin Celestin Member Open New York Open New York **Dorothy Windham** Member Open New York Matthew Denys Member Open New York Michael Kaess Member Open New York Olivia Killingsworth Member Open New York Erik Nilsen* Member Open Plans Jackson Chabot Director of Advocacy Open Plans Michael Sutherland Policy Analyst Open Plans Talya Schwartz Lead Strategist, Urban Mobility Open Plans Emily Chingay* Citywide Engagement Advocate **Project Renewal** Eric Rosenbaum President & CEO **REBNY** Basha Gerhards Senior VP of Planning

REBNY / Principal, Hill West Architects David West Zoning and Design Committee

Regional Plan Association Maulin Mehta New York Director
Riseboro Community Partnership/NYHC Emily Kurtz Chief Housing Officer

Robin Hood Foundation Chloe Sarnoff Director Policy, Res. & Initiatives

Supportive Housing Network of New York Pascale Leone Executive Director West Side Federation for Senior/Support. Housing Eustacia Smith Representative

Note: Many of the organizations listed in the "Yes to Housing" Coalition are already affiliated with the New York Housing Conference and sit on the Executive Board or Board.

^{*}Adam Broadheim, Emily Chingay, Samir Lavingia, Erik Nilsen, Vishnu Reddy and Elena Sytcheva purposefully did not identify their affiliation with these organizations.

Mayor Adams City of Yes for Housing Opportunity – Press Release Signatory

22 (35%.5) out of 62 organizations that testified in favor on July 10th, 2024, public hearing were signatories to Mayor Adams press release from September 25th, 2024. The press release was sent out immediately after the City Planning Commission voted in favor of the *City of Yes for Housing Opportunity*.

List of Organizations Who Participated in Mayor Adams's Press Release:

Organization	Representative	Title
Advisory Board on Historic Preservation	Sara Bronin	Chair
American Institute of Architects NY	Jesse Lazar	Executive Director
Association for a Better New York	Chad Purkey	Interim Executive Director
Citizens Budget Commission	Andrew S. Rein	President
Citizens Housing & Planning Council	Howard Slatkin	Executive Director
Community Preservation Corporation	Rafael E. Cestero	CEO
Habitat for Humanity	Sabrina Lippman	CEO
Housing Rights Initiative	Aaron Carr	Founder & Executive Director
New York Building Congress	Carlo A. Scissura, Esq.	President & CEO
New York Housing Conference	Rachel Fee	Executive Director
New York League of Conservation Voters	Alia Soomro	Deputy Director of Policy
Niskanen Center	Alex Armlovich	Senior Housing Policy Analyst
Open New York	Annemarie Gray	Executive Director
Open Plans	Sara Lind	Co-Executive Director
Project Renewal	Eric Rosenbaum	President & CEO
Regional Plan Association	Tom Wright	President & CEO
Riseboro Community Partnership/NYHC	Emily Kurtz	Chief Housing Officer
Robin Hood Foundation	Chloe Sarnoff	Director Policy, Res. & Initiatives
SEIU / Local 32BJ	Manny Pasreich	President
Tech: NYC	Marjorie Velasquez	Vice-President of Policy
Transportation Alternatives	Elizabeth Adams	Interim Co-Executive Director
West Side Federation for Senior/Support. Housing	g Paul Freitag	Executive Director

Note: Italics denote that the organization testified on July 10th, 2024, with a different speaker than listed.

Testimony - Samir Lavingia

Samir Lavingia is the Campaign Coordinator, an employee and a registered lobbyist for Open New York, Inc., a group that is incorporated in Delaware and that is a member of the New York Housing Conference's "Yes to Housing" coalition. Open New York has a PAC and also directly lobbies the New York City Government. <u>Lavingia purposefully did not identify his affiliation</u>, <u>employment and lobbying status when he gave his testimony</u> (pp. 463-467):

Hello! My name is Samir Lavingia. I also just wanted to say I'm the former Chair of Manhattan [Community] Board 5. And because I met at least one of you in that capacity, I want to be clear that I'm no longer in that position. And I'm speaking as a person, in my personal capacity as a resident. So I live over in Midtown at 55th and Broadway. And I'm one of those statistics. I'm severely rent burdened. I pay over 50% of my income in rent. I live in a market rate building, and my rent keeps going up. My parents live a block away from me, which is great. In a market rate, building their rents keep going up. My brother and his wife live in DUMBO in a market rate building, and their rents also keep going up, you may see a pattern here. We're a family of renters who are constantly at risk of displacement, and that is why I'm here to speak, because I want myself and my family to be able to stay in our communities for as long as we'd like to. As a millennial in this high-cost market, I'm all but assured to never be able to have home ownership within reach, so rental is really my only option. And thankfully you know, at the state level, they pass good cause eviction that will help with stability. But it's not going to help me if I want to have kids and find a bigger home. It's not going to help my parents move closer to my brother and his wife, if they want to have kids. But what will help us is a little bit more housing in every neighborhood which is what City of Yes does. I'm personally excited about a few of the proposals that I want to talk about – UAP. I personally make around 80% AMI, and it would add so many options for me and others to live all over the city in our own communities, instead of where the affordable housing has been really shunted to in the city. We need permanently affordable income restricted housing. And you know personally in my neighborhood. Again. I live in Midtown. If you're adding 20% additional floor area, you know, you're maybe going from a 40-story building to a 50-story building, we're just not going to notice that from the street level, and I think that's a great place to do it. I'm also excited about office to residential conversions. I personally love the Garment District area. I love all of Broadway and I'd like to be able to live there. It will make the area safer with more residents. It'll allow businesses to have more customers within walking distance. It'll help workers live closer to their jobs. And in the future, you know, we're going to have the Midtown South mixed-use plan come to our district, and I think it would be great to have options for the 15 and 18 FAR, with mandatory inclusionary housing to be an option for us. At broad strokes, I wanted to say that I'm thrilled about how many homes and affordable homes is going to bring for the people who the market will not be able to provide housing for. We'll have income restricted units for them and for the average person, they'll be able to hop on Street Easy and just look at, you know, rents or units the way they normally would. You know, I longingly look towards cities like Austin, where they met and beat the demand and rents are falling, and I hope that can happen to us, too. I support every single proposal in the City of Yes for low, medium and high-density districts, because what happens in other districts impacts me and my family. It impacts the rents that we pay. And I want to say thank you to all of you for listening, and to

DCP who has been, you know, at countless community board meetings answering our questions. So thank you, all of you.

Note: Lavingia's tenure as Chair of Community Board 5 Manhattan was cut short due to concerns about the undue lobbying influence of Open New York, as has been reported on in numerous media outlets in the first half of 2024. As for Lavingia's claim of being "severely rent-burdened" from his apartment lease, this is unlikely. Lavingia has been renting his apartment for \$3,795 per month since April 2023 and his rent has not gone up. Prior to taking his position at Open New York, his previous employment was as a Senior Software Engineer for Google and Twitter/X for 5 years; those jobs have an average salary of approximately \$200,000 per year. Notwithstanding his protests about his family member's rent burdens, Lavingia and his family members have chosen to live in several of the most affluent and expensive neighborhoods in the city.

Testimony - Vishnu Reddy

Vishnu Reddy is the Queens Chapter Leader of Open New York, Inc., a group that is incorporated in Delaware and that is a member of the New York Housing Conference's "Yes to Housing" coalition. Open New York has a PAC and also directly lobbies the New York City Government. Reddy purposefully did not identify his affiliation when he gave his testimony (pp. 1145-1148):

My name is Vishnu Reddy, and I live in Sunnyside Queens. I'm here to express my unequivocal support for the City of Yes for Housing Opportunity. In my neighborhood of Sunnyside, asking rents have skyrocketed over the last few years, and this story has repeated itself all over the city, and it's because our city and our region is facing a dire housing shortage that is decades in the making. The runaway increases in housing costs, this shortage has caused, has harmed all but the most wealthy New Yorkers, and especially the most vulnerable. We don't have to live like this, and it's time we do something about it. I want to live in a city that welcomes people seeking abortion in the Post-Roe era. I want to live in a city where queer folks can come to find safety and community. I want to live in a city that gives hope to immigrants seeking opportunity and a better life. We cannot have that city If only the wealthy can afford to live here. New York has long had a reputation as a safe harbor for the most vulnerable people seeking a better future. With the way in housing shortages is going, we're quickly losing that reputation, and we must take action. I also want to emphasize that City of Yes is just to start. This proposal is a great step in the right direction, but it's not nearly enough to fill the gaps caused by decades of underbuilt. We need the city to continue to encourage the creation of more homes. We also need help from Albany to help fund affordable housing, and to make sure the suburbs are pulling their weight when it comes to housing creation. The City of Yes is a great step forward, and I can't wait to see what else we can do to get out of this mess. I'm really really grateful for the thankless work from the staff at City Planning for seeing this through and for the hard work being done by organizers all across the city to advocate for more livable and affordable New York. I'm also especially impressed by all questioners here today, and I appreciate you all for sticking it out. Thank you for your time.

Testimony - Emily Chingay

Emily Chingay is the Citywide Engagement Advocate and an employee for Open Plans, a group that is a member of the New York Housing Conference's "Yes to Housing" coalition. Open Plans also directly lobbies the New York City Government. Chingay purposefully did not identify her affiliation or employment status when she gave her testimony (pp. 797-799):

Hello, thank you so much for the opportunity to speak. My name is Emily Chingay, and I'll keep this brief, because I think there's a lot of really great things already said about supporting City of Yes Housing proposal. So I live in Astoria. I've lived in my current apartment for about 2 years now. And I love my neighborhood. I love that. I'm close to my friends, my sister, and I would really love to stay here and not risk being priced out and not being able to afford my apartment. And I think just like many other New Yorkers here, we're always at risk of being priced out. So as we all know, the housing market is incredibly competitive, and we are long overdue for some zoning changes so I really wanted to express my support for the City of Yes Housing Proposal. And of course I'd like to support eliminating parking mandates, citywide. Lower Manhattan, currently doesn't have these mandates. But as our city continues to grow, we need to get rid of these outdated policies and create more affordable housing, and neighborhoods. And also wanted to highlight that by eliminating Parking mandates It's just making parking requirements, I mean, it's just making parking optional so developers will most definitely continue to build, and create parking. It's just making it optional. So thank you again for you time.

<u>Testimony – Elena Sytcheva</u>

Elena Sytcheva is the Co-Managing Director of Housing, Regulatory Compliance and Affordable Housing Development for Metropolitan New York Coordinating Council on Jewish Poverty, an organization that has significant financial dealings with the City of New York. Sytcheva purposefully did not identify her affiliation or employment status when she gave her testimony (pp. 1145-1148):

Good morning Chalr Garodnick and members of the Commission. Thank you for the opportunity to testify in favor of the City of Yes initiative. I also want to acknowledge all of the hard work of the city planning staff on this proposal. And today, this evening, this morning at this hearing. My name is Elena Sytcheva and I'm a lifelong Brooklyn resident of over 30 years. I grew up in Mitchell Lama housing in Sheepshead Bay Brooklyn and I currently rent in the Greenpoint neighborhood in Brooklyn CB 1. And, it would be my preference to stay and raise a family here in this great borough. My parents immigrated from the former Soviet Union and were able to remain in New York and work in the public service sector because of their access to affordable home ownership. This allowed me to have a wonderful cultural, educational and career opportunities, and I'm concerned that this is no longer a possibility for my generation. My friends and colleagues are being forced to leave the neighborhoods they love because of significant cost of living increases. This is especially true for young working class families with children. We are all well aware of the severe housing crisis in New York City, and I will not repeat the data that has been cited by previous speakers on low vacancy rates and skyrocketing rents. I'm here because I believe this proposal will provide much needed affordable housing for New Yorkers by creating

permanent affordability through UAP, making parking optional instead of required, and a common sense solution for transit oriented development. All of these solutions will help New Yorkers remain in the communities they love and will allow our great city to continue welcoming new residents. I urge the Commission to approve this proposal in the strongest form. We cannot afford to wait. Thank you for your time, and I commend you all for staying so late.

Note: Met Council on Jewish Poverty's CEO since 2018 is David Greenfield, a longtime political ally of Mayor Adams and a former Councilmember who was the Land Use Committee Chair during ZQA-MIH citywide rezoning actions during the DeBlasio administration. Greenfield also wrote a pro-City of Yes for Housing Opportunity op-ed in his capacity as CEO of Met Council on Jewish Poverty in the Daily News entitled "Add homes for Nyers who need them most" published on September 25th, 2024 (the day of the CPC vote).